



RESEARCH PAPER

OPEN ACCESS

Milk adulteration: An old traditional threat to public health in Quetta, Pakistan

Hafiz Muhammad Arif¹, Nadeem Rashid¹, Majid Rafeeq¹, Babar Hilal¹,
Shahzad Ahmad², Abdul Nasir², Muhammad Din²

¹Center for Advanced Studies in Vaccinology & Biotechnology (CASVAB),
University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan

²Livestock & Dairy Development Department, Quetta, Pakistan

Article published on February 28, 2019

Key words: Milk adulteration, Quetta, Water, Balochistan.

Abstract

Balochistan is the largest province of Pakistan that makes 44% of the total geographical area of the country. Most of the area is rangelands with only 5% arable area. Animal agriculture is centuries old occupation of the people of Balochistan. Livestock are one of the major important sectors of the province having about 20% of the national stock. Quetta being capital of the province with more than 2million population. Generally the milk is supplied from neighboring areas like, Jacobabad, Sibi and even Multan in summer season. Dairy farms in Quetta are in small proportion that does not meet the demand of the city. Most the milk man adulterate the milk with water and even skim milk powder and sale it in retail outlets with substandard fat percentage. However, other common adulterants include, urea, oil, sugar, detergent, salts and chloroform etc. At government level no food safety authority exists in order to keep check on food item on regular basis. It is recommended that food safety authority may be constituted and regular survey may be conducted to overlook the milk adulteration. Furthermore, Milk testing facility may be provided at Provincial Diagnostic laboratory under Livestock Department in the area. This review intends to contribute towards consumer's knowledge and awareness with reference to possible adulteration and its detection techniques.

*Corresponding Author: Dr Hafiz Muhammad Arif ✉ drhafizarif@gmail.com

Introduction

Agriculture sector in Pakistan plays key role in the economy of the country. It contributes 19% to the GDP and absorbs 19% labor force. While Livestock being sub sector shares 59% in agriculture (ESC, 2017). Balochistan being the largest province of the country where major occupation of the people is the livestock rearing as open farming system in free rangelands. The province has only 5% arable area only. The province is the cradle for many precious breeds of different animals. About 44% of total Sheep population of the country is reared here followed by goats, cattle and camels. Most of the population is rural based with tribal system of social life. Milk is the natural highly valuable and good source of highly source protein, vitamins and minerals. Natural pure milk has many advantages and is used for the treatment of different ailments in addition to basic primary diet of infants (Afzal *et al.*, 2011). But if adulterated, it poses serious effects on the health of individuals. Adulteration is an international act that not only reduces the quality of milk but also keep the life on threat.

Generally, different non-natural products are added for different purposes such as increasing viscosity, preservation, high fat content and flavor etc. Several peer reviewed papers have documented the adulteration of milk more generally with water throughout the globe. Chemical adulterants are used for different purposes such as, starch, chlorine, hydrated lime, sodium carbonate, formalin and ammonium sulfate. To meet the shortfall of milk, synthetic milk is prepared by mixing urea, caustic soda, refined oil and common detergents that have many serious injurious effects over body health. Widespread use of these chemical preservatives especially in warm weather is a great concern in food industry. With the advancement of technology, newer techniques have been invented to detect different kinds of milk adulterants, but in the same pace the complex methods of milk adulteration and varieties of milk adulterants have been evolved. A large number of research papers have been published on milk adulteration and detection (Karoui & De Baerdemaeker, 2007).

This paper attempts to review two main milk adulterants commonly practiced in Quetta region, viz, Water and Powder milk. Although different detection techniques for individual adulterant and comprehensive studies have been carried out on the detection technology by electrical means. The biological components of the biosensor are enzymes, whole cells, tissues, receptors and antibodies. Many biosensors are integrated with the electrical sensors to detect milk adulteration. Often lactose concentration is used as a basic marker for the evaluation of milk quality and detection of abnormalities. It has been found that milk from cows suffering mastitis has low lactose levels (Conzuelo *et al.*, 2010).

There has been extensive research in evaluating electronic noses for monitoring the quality of milk. E-nose can monitor the aging of milk and can detect milk volatile compounds (Capone *et al.*, 2001). The two main components of an electronic nose (E-nose) are the sensing system and the automated pattern recognition system (Yu *et al.*, 2007). The common pattern recognition systems are either principal component analysis (PCA), linear discriminant analysis (LDA) or artificial neural network (ANN). Potentiometric electronic tongues using lipid/ polymer membranes has the ability to classify vast kinds of chemical substances into several groups, which can be found in the taste reception in biological systems (Toko, 1998). The potentiometric electronic tongue reported by them includes an automatic sampling system, a sensor array with a reference electrode, a signal processing unit and a personal computer with the required software (Astree 3.0.1.). The data obtained from the electronic tongue is processed by principal components analysis (PCA) to get the variance in the experimental data (Hruskar *et al.*, 2009).

Water adultration in Milk

Water addition not only increases the volume but causes change in density also. Estimation of freezing point (FP) of milk is the traditional standard test for water addition to milk samples. However, certain other commercial instruments are available for such determination and can evaluate more samples.

Lactometer is traditionally used for water estimation in milk samples in field conditions. However, now a days with the advent of newly developed technology Lactoscan, can estimate more parameters with high accuracy. Freezing Point is achieved, if the temperature of frozen milk does not change by 0.5milli degree Celsius over 20 seconds. Although it is simple test but is not a routine test. Addition of sugars and salts as preservatives decreases the FP of watered milk. Similarly, acidity development also cause problems while detecting the freezing Point. Infrared spectroscopy and chemometrics is another powerful tool for milk analysis. The combination of advanced instrumentation used in IR spectroscopy and chemometrics provides a powerful tool for quality and authenticity analysis of milk (Rodriguez-Saona *et al.*, 2011). It has been used in combination with 2D correlation for milk adulterants analysis (He *et al.*, 2010).

Detection of Synthetic Milk

This is yet another common practice in most of the countries. When milk sellers mix Synthetic powder milk to raw milk in order to increase the volume. More commonly it is admixed for curd preparation and preparation of more value-added products with more profits (Anita, 2013). Synthetic milk is reported to be used for the 5–10% ratio (PARADKAR *et al.*, 2000). Addition of cheap power milk to raw unpasteurized milk is also a very common practice especially in low income countries. Certain assays such as, RNAase activity for determination in milk (Ju *et al.*, 1991) are very useful for the estimation of milk powder in raw milk samples.

Capillary electrophoretic is another discriminatory method for the determination of adulteration of fresh milk with milk powders (Recio *et al.*, 1997).

Emerging Methods

Conventional regular chemical methods have limited advantages in screening the adulterants in milk samples. However, newly introduced advanced techniques such as MIR, PCR, and NIR have been applied for the analysis of milk and dairy products (Table.1). Hand-held infrared (IR) spectrometers in conjunction with multivariate analysis have also been

demonstrated by (Santos *et al.*, 2013) for monitoring of milk adulteration by tap water, synthetic urine, urea, synthetic milk and hydrogen peroxide and whey.

Table 1. Different methods used for estimation of milk adulteration.

Sr No	Adulterants	Detection Methods	References
1	Chlorine	Sequential injection analysis Flow injection analysis Potentiometric detection Conductometric sequential injection analysis	(Lima <i>et al.</i> , 2004) (Ferreira <i>et al.</i> , 1994) (Lima <i>et al.</i> , 2000) (Silva <i>et al.</i> , 1999)
2	Antibiotics	Electrical conductivity BRT Test Spot Test SNAP test and LACTEK test Chromatography (HPLC) Liquid chromatography mass spectrometry Somatic cell count (SCC)	(Janzekovic <i>et al.</i> , 2009) (Molina <i>et al.</i> , 2003) (Ryan <i>et al.</i> , 1986) (Escobar, 1999) (Perez <i>et al.</i> , 2002) (Ghidini <i>et al.</i> , 2003) (Ruegg, 2005)
3	Non Milk Proteins	Fluorescence spectroscopy Analysis of triacylglycerols using gas liquid Chromatography NIR spectroscopy Electrical conductivity and capacitive reactance Reversed Phase HPLC method in combination with fluorescence detector Sulfate capillary electrophoresis and chromarography E-nose	(Ntakatsane <i>et al.</i> , 2013) (Timms, 1980) (Sato <i>et al.</i> , 1990) (Lawton <i>et al.</i> , 1993) (Luykx <i>et al.</i> , 2007) (López-Tapia <i>et al.</i> , 1999) (Capone <i>et al.</i> , 2000)
4	Low valued Milk	Optical biosensor (BIACORE 3000) tool Duplex polymerase chain reaction Gas chromatography ELISA and PCR techniques Reverse-phase high performance liquid chromatography and TaqMan real time PCR HPLC method Sandwich IgG ELISA	(Haasnoot <i>et al.</i> , 2004) (Mafra <i>et al.</i> , 2007) (Farag <i>et al.</i> , 1984) (Lopez-Calleja <i>et al.</i> , 2007) (Veloso <i>et al.</i> , 2002) (Zhang <i>et al.</i> , 2007) (Enne <i>et al.</i> , 2005) (Hurley <i>et al.</i> , 2006)
5	Milk Powder	FAST (Fluorescence of advanced maillard products and soluble tryptophan)	(Guan <i>et al.</i> , 2005)

Sr No	Adulterants	Detection Methods	References
6	Color	Capillary electrophoresis	(Huang <i>et al.</i> , 2002)
7	Preservative	Conductivity	(Grillo <i>et al.</i> , 2002)
		Impedance	(Biswas <i>et al.</i> , 2006)
8	Neutralizers	Conductivity or pH measurement	(Sadat <i>et al.</i> , 2006)
9	Urea	Potentiometric biosensor	(Trivedi <i>et al.</i> , 2009)
		pH measurement	(Luzzana & Giardino, 1999)
		Calorimetric method	(Bhavadasan, 2014)
		Biosensors	(Renny <i>et al.</i> , 2005)
10	Whey/ Liquid	Reverse phase HPLC method	(Olieman & Van Riel, 1989)
		Capillary Electrophoresis	(Recio <i>et al.</i> , 2000, Bremer <i>et al.</i> , 2008)
		ELISA	Recio <i>et al.</i> , 2000)
		Fourth derivative spectroscopy	(Miralles <i>et al.</i> , 2000)
		Blot immunoassay method	(Chávez <i>et al.</i> , 2008)
11	Water	Frequency admittance measurements	(Mabrook <i>et al.</i> , 2002)
		Electrical conductivity	(Mabrook <i>et al.</i> , 2003)
		Freezing point osmometry and cryoscopic method	(Mabrook <i>et al.</i> , 2002)

Conclusion

The ultimate aim of adulteration of milk is the gain of financial benefits. It is more frequently practiced in undeveloped countries where no or less effective food authority or regulatory body exists and even work in traditional way. Hypertension, renal, skin, eye diseases, heart problem and cancer are some of the common disease caused by consumption of adulterated milk. This study intends to alert the regional government to establish efficient regulatory and food safety authorities to ensure the supply of unadulterated milk to the communities. An early establishment of milk testing laboratory in the province is utmost necessary for smooth screening of milk samples.

References

Afzal A, Mahmood M, Hussain I, Akhtar. 2011. Adulteration and Microbiological Quality of Milk (A Review). *Pakistan Journal of Nutrition* **10**, 1195-202.

Anita S. 2013. Increasing Adulteration in Milk as Synthetic Milk and Methods for their Detection. *Foodscience Research Journal* **4**, 98-9.

Bhavadasan M. 2014. A Simple Colorimetric Method for the Determination of Urea in Milk. *Indian Journal of Dairy Science.*

Biswas K, Sen S, Dutta Pkjs, Chemical Ab. 2006. A Constant Phase Element Sensor for Monitoring Microbial Growth. *Sensor and Actuators* **119**, 186-91.

Bremer Mg, Kemmers-Voncken Ae, Boers Ea, Frankhuizen R, Haasnoot. 2008. Enzyme-Linked Immunosorbent Assay for the Detection of Bovine Rennet Whey Powder in Milk Powder and Buttermilk Powder. *International Dairy Journal* **18**, 294-302.

Capone S, Epifani M, Quaranta F. et al. 2001. Monitoring of Rancidity of Milk by Means of an Electronic Nose and A Dynamic Pca Analysis. *Sensors And Actuators* **78**, 174-9.

Capone S, Siciliano P, Quaranta F, et al. 2000. Analysis of Vapours and Foods By Means of An Electronic Nose Based on A Sol-Gel Metal Oxide Sensors Array. *Sensors And Actuators* **69**, 230-5.

Chávez Na, Salinas E, Jauregui J, Palomares La, Macias Kjf. 2008. Detection of Bovine Milk Adulterated With Cheese Whey By Western Blot Immunoassay. *Food and Agricultural Immunology* **19**, 265-72.

Conzuelo F, Gamella M, Campuzano S, et al. 2010. An Integrated Amperometric Biosensor for the Determination of Lactose in Milk and Dairy Products. *Journal of Agriculture and Food Chemistry* **58**, 7141-8.

Economic Survey Pakistan. 2017.

Enne G, Elez D, Fondrini F, Bonizzi I, Feligini M, Aleandri. 2005. High-Performance Liquid Chromatography of Governing Liquid to Detect Illegal Bovine Milk's Addition in Water Buffalo Mozzarella: Comparison With Results From Raw Milk And Cheese Matrix. *Journal Of Chromatography A* **1094**, 169-74.

Escobar E. 1999. Use Of Antibiotic Residue Test Kits For Goat Milk. In. *Proc. 14th Ann. Goat Field Day.* Langston Univ Langston, Ok 115-8.

- Farag R, Hewedi M, Abo-Raya S, Khalifa.** 1984. Detection of Cow Milk Admixture to Buffalo Milk. *Journal of American oil Chemist Society* **61**, 913-6.
- Ferreira Im, Lima Jf, Rangel.** 1994. Flow Injection Titration of Chloride in Food Products with A Silver Tubular Electrode Based on an Homogeneous Crystalline Membrane. *Journal of Food Chemistry* **50**, 423-8.
- Ghidini S, Zanardi E, Varisco G, Chizzolini Rjfa.** 2003. Residues Of B-Lactam Antibiotics In Bovine Milk: Confirmatory Analysis By Liquid Chromatography Tandem Mass Spectrometry After Microbial Assay Screening. *Food Additive Contaminants* **20**, 528-34.
- Grillo Gj, Pérez Ma, Anton Jc, Ferrero Fj.** Direct-Evaluation of the Fresh-Milk Somatic Cell Concentration (Scc) Through Electrical Permittivity Measurements. *Proceedings of the Instrumentation and Measurement Technology Conference, 2002. Imtc/2002. Proceedings of the 19th Ieee, 2002: Ieee*, 153-7.
- Guan RF, Liu DH, Ye XQ, Yang Kj.** 2005. Use of Fluorometry for Determination of Skim Milk Powder Adulteration in Fresh Milk. *Journal of Zhejiang University Science* **6**, 1101.
- Haasnoot W, Smits Ng, Kemmers-Voncken Ae, Bremer.** 2004. Fast Biosensor Immunoassays for the Detection of Cows' Milk in the Milk of Ewes and Goats **71**, 322-9.
- He B, Liu R, Yang R, Xu K.** Adulteration Detection In Milk Using Infrared Spectroscopy Combined With Two-Dimensional Correlation Analysis. *Proceedings of The Optical Diagnostics And Sensing X: Toward Point-of-Care Diagnostics, 2010: International Society For Optics And Photonics*, 75720p.
- Huang HY, Shih YC, Chen Y.** 2002. Determining Eight Colorants in Milk Beverages by Capillary Electrophoresis. *Journal of Chromatography* **959**, 317-25.
- Hurley Ip, Coleman Rc, Ireland He, Williams J.** 2006. Use of Sandwich Igg Elisa for the Detection and Quantification of Adulteration of Milk and Soft Cheese. *International Dairy Journal* **16**, 805-12.
- Janzekovic M, Brus M, Mursec B, et al.** 2009. Mastitis Detection Based on Electric Conductivity of Milk. *Journal of Achievements in Materials and Manufacturing Engineering* **34**, 39-46.
- Ju C, Chou W, Lin Cj.** 1991. Studies on Detection of Reconstituted Milk in Raw and Pasteurized Milk Through Determination of Milk Rnaase Activity. *Journal of Zhejiang University Science* **20**, 103-14.
- Karoui R, De Baerdemaeker J.** 2007. A Review of the Analytical Methods Coupled with Chemometric Tools for the Determination of the Quality and Identity of Dairy Products. *Food Chemistry* **102**, 621-40.
- Lawton B, Pethig R.** 1993. Determining the Fat Content of Milk and Cream Using Ac Conductivity Measurements **4**, 38.
- Lima J, Delerue-Matos C, Vaz Mj.** 2000. Potentiometric Flow Titration with Increased Sensitive Detector for Determination of Chlorides in Milk and Dairy Products. *Ciencia Y Tecnologia Alimentaria* **2**, 234-9.
- Lima Mr, Fernandes Sm, Rangel A.** 2004. Sequential Injection Titration of Chloride in Milk with Potentiometric Detection. *Ciencia Y Tecnologia Alimentaria* **15**, 609-13.
- Lopez-Calleja Im, Gonzalez I, Fajardo V, Hernandez Pe, Garcia T, Martin Rj.** 2007. Application of an Indirect Elisa and A Pcr Technique for Detection of Cows' Milk in Sheep's and Goats' Milk Cheeses. *Journal of Chromatography* **17**, 87-93.
- López-Tapia J, Garcí a-Risco Mr, Manso Maa, López-Fandiño R.** 1999. Detection of the Presence of Soya Protein in Milk Powder By Sodium Dodecyl Sulfate Capillary Electrophoresis. *Journal of Chromatography* **836**, 153-60.

- Luykx Dm, Cordewener Jh, Ferranti P, et al.** 2007. Identification of Plant Proteins in Adulterated Skimmed Milk Powder by High-Performance Liquid Chromatography–Mass Spectrometry. *American Journal of Chromatography* **1164**, 189-97.
- Luzzana M, Giardino Rj.** 1999. Urea Determination In Milk By A Differential Ph Technique. *Le Lait, Inra Editions* **79(2)**, pp. 261-267.
- Mabrook M, Petty Mjs.** 2002. Application of Electrical Admittance Measurements to the Quality Control of Milk. *Sensors and Actuators* **84**, 136-41.
- Mabrook M, Petty Mjs.** 2003. A Novel Technique for the Detection of Added Water to Full Fat Milk Using Single Frequency Admittance Measurements. *Sensors and Actuators* **96**, 215-8.
- Mafra I, Roxo Á, Ferreira Im, Oliveira M.** 2007. A Duplex Polymerase Chain Reaction for the Quantitative Detection of Cows' Milk in Goats' Milk Cheese. *International Dairy Journal* **17**, 1132-8.
- Miralles B, Bartolomé B, Ramos M, Amigo L.** 2000. Determination of Whey Protein to Total Protein Ratio in Uht Milk Using Fourth Derivative Spectroscopy. *International Dairy Journal* **10**, 191-7.
- Molina A, Molina M, Althaus R, Gallego Lj.** 2003. Residue Persistence In Sheep Milk Following Antibiotic Therapy. *International Dairy Journal* **165**, 84-9.
- Ntakatsane M, Liu X, Zhou Pj.** 2013. Rapid Detection of Milk Fat Adulteration with Vegetable Oil by Fluorescence Spectroscopy. *Journal of Food Science and Technolingu-Mysure* **96**, 2130-6.
- Olieman C, Van Riel J.** 1989. Buttermilk Powder with Reversed-Phase Hplc. *Netherland Milk and Dairy Journal*. **43**, 171-84.
- Paradkar Mm, Singhal Rs, Kulkarni Pr.** 2000. An Approach to the Detection of Synthetic Milk in Dairy Milk: 1. Detection of Urea. *International Dairy Journal* **53**, 87-91.
- Perez N, Gutierrez R, Noa M, et al.** 2002. Liquid Chromatographic Determination of Multiple Sulfonamides, Nitrofurans, and Chloramphenicol Residues in Pasteurized Milk. *Proceedngs of Iees Sensors* **85**, 20-4.
- Recio I, Amigo L, López-Fandiño Rj.** 1997. Assessment of the Quality of Dairy Products by Capillary Electrophoresis of Milk Proteins. *International Dairy Journal* **697**, 231-42.
- Recio I, Garcí a-Risco Mr, López-Fandiño R, Olano An, Ramos M.** 2000. Detection of Rennet Whey Solids In Uht Milk By Capillary Electrophoresis. *International Dairy Journal* **10**, 333-8.
- Renny E, Daniel D, Krastanov A, Zachariah C, Elizabeth.** 2005. Enzyme Based Sensor for Detection of Urea in Milk. *Research Journal of Biotechnological Equipment* **19**, 198-201.
- Rodriguez-Saona L, Allendorf M.** 2011. Use of Ftir for Rapid Authentication and Detection of Adulteration of Food. *Journal of Dairy Science* **2**, 467-83.
- Ruegg Pl.** 2005. Relationship Between Bulk Tank Milk Somatic Cell Count and Antibiotic Residues. *Proceedings of the Proceeding of the 2005 National Mastitis Council Meeting. National Mastitis Council* **28**.
- Ryan J, Wildman E, Duthie A, Atherton H, Aleong J.** 1986. Detection of Penicillin, Cephapirin, and Cloxacillin in Commingled Raw Milk By The Spot Test 1. *Journal of Dairy Science* **69**, 1510-7.
- Sadat A, Mustajab P, Khan I.** 2006. Determining the Adulteration of Natural Milk with Synthetic Milk Using Ac Conductance Measurement. *Special Issue of International Journal of Computer Applications* **77**, 472-7.
- Santos P, Pereira-Filho E, Rodriguez-Saona.** 2013. Rapid Detection and Quantification of Milk Adulteration Using Infrared Microspectroscopy and Chemometrics Analysis. *Food Chemistry* **138**, 19-24.
- Sato T, Kawano S, Iwamoto Mj.** 1990. Detection of Foreign Fat Adulteration of Milk Fat by Near Infrared Spectroscopic Method. *Measurement Science & Technology* **73**, 3408-13.

- Silva Fv, Souza Gb, Ferraz Lf, Nogueira A.** 1999. Determination of Chloride in Milk Using Sequential Injection Automated Conductimetry. *Food Chemistry* **67**, 317-22.
- Timms Re.** 1980. Detection And Quantification of Non-Milk Fat In Mixtures of Milk and Non-Milk Fats. *Journal of Dairy Research* **47**, 295-303.
- Toko K.** 1998. Retracted: Electronic Tongue. In. Elsevier.
- Trivedi U, Lakshminarayana D, Kothari I, et al.** 2009. Potentiometric Biosensor for Urea Determination in Milk. *Sensors and Actuators B: Chemical* **140**, 260-6.
- Veloso Ac, Teixeira N, Ferreira I.** 2002. Separation and Quantification of the Major Casein Fractions by Reverse-Phase High-Performance Liquid Chromatography and Urea–Polyacrylamide Gel Electrophoresis: Detection of Milk Adulterations. *Journal of Chromatography* **967**, 209-18.
- Yu H, Wang J, Xu Yjs, Materials.** 2007. Identification of Adulterated Milk Using Electronic Nose. *Sensors and Materials* **19**, 275-85.
- Zhang CL, Fowler Mr, Scott Nw, Lawson G, Slater A.** 2007. A Taqman Real-Time Pcr System for the Identification and Quantification of Bovine Dna in Meats, Milks And Cheeses. *Food Control* **8**, 1149-58.